

NOTE: This order is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**IN RE: ENTRESTO (SACUBITRIL/VALSARTAN)**

---

**NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,**  
*Plaintiff-Appellant*

v.

**TORRENT PHARMA INC., TORRENT  
PHARMACEUTICALS LTD.**  
*Defendants*

---

**NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,**  
*Plaintiff-Appellant*

v.

**ALEMBIC PHARMACEUTICALS LIMITED,  
ALEMBIC PHARMACEUTICALS INC.,**  
*Defendants*

---

**NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,**  
*Plaintiff-Appellant*

v.

**MSN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., MSN  
LABORATORIES PRIVATE LTD., MSN LIFE  
SCIENCES PRIVATE LTD.,**  
*Defendants-Appellees*

2

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION v.  
TORRENT PHARMA INC.

**HETERO USA, INC., HETERO LABS LIMITED,  
HETERO LABS LIMITED UNIT-III,**  
*Defendants*

---

2023-2218, 2023-2220, 2023-2221

---

Appeals from the United States District Court for the District of Delaware in Nos. 1:19-cv-01979-RGA, 1:19-cv-02021-RGA, 1:19-cv-02053-RGA, 1:19-cv-02053-RGA, 1:20-md-02930-RGA, Judge Richard G. Andrews.

---

**ON MOTION AND ON PETITION FOR PANEL  
REHEARING AND REHEARING EN BANC**

---

Before MOORE, *Chief Judge*, LOURIE, DYK, PROST, REYNA,  
TARANTO, CHEN, HUGHES, and STOLL, *Circuit Judges*.<sup>1</sup>

PER CURIAM.

**O R D E R**

MSN Laboratories Private Ltd., MSN Life Sciences Private Ltd. and MSN Pharmaceuticals, Inc. move for reconsideration en banc of the court's January 21, 2025, order. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation responds in opposition and MSN moves for leave to file a reply.

MSN subsequently filed a combined petition for panel rehearing and rehearing en banc. A response to the petition was invited by the court and filed by Novartis. Association for Accessible Medicines requested leave to file a brief as amicus curiae, which the court granted.

The motion for reconsideration and the petition were first referred to the panel that heard the appeal, and

---

<sup>1</sup> Circuit Judge Newman, Circuit Judge Cunningham, and Circuit Judge Stark did not participate.

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION v.  
TORRENT PHARMA INC.

3

thereafter the motion and the petition were referred to the circuit judges who are in regular active service.

Upon consideration thereof,

IT IS ORDERED THAT:

- (1) The motion for leave to file a reply is denied.
- (2) The motion for reconsideration is denied.
- (3) The petition for panel rehearing is denied.
- (4) The petition for rehearing en banc is denied.

FOR THE COURT



Jarrett B. Perlow  
Clerk of Court

March 25, 2025

Date